OKI Participation Plan

January 2018

Ohio-Kentucky-Indiana Regional Council of Governments
720 East Pete Rose Way, Suite 420
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202
513-621-6300
www.oki.org

The preparation of this document was financed cooperatively by the Federal Highway Administration, the Federal Transit Administration, the Commonwealth of Kentucky Transportation Cabinet, the Ohio Department of Transportation, the Indiana Department of Transportation, the units of local and county government in the OKI region. The opinions, findings, and conclusions expressed in this document are those of the OKI Regional Council of Governments and are not necessarily those of the U.S. Department of Transportation. This report does not constitute a standard, specification, or regulation.
RESOLUTION

OF THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS OF THE
OHIO-KENTUCKY-INDIANA REGIONAL COUNCIL OF GOVERNMENTS

AUTHORIZING ADOPTION OF THE UPDATE TO THE
OKI PARTICIPATION PLAN

WHEREAS, the Ohio-Kentucky-Indiana Regional Council of Governments has adopted a Participation Plan that meets the planning regulations of Fixing America's Surface Transportation (FAST) Act at all levels as part of a comprehensive public/community outreach; and

WHEREAS, the Participation Plan is periodically updated by OKI staff on an on-going basis to ensure consistency with federal regulations and guidelines; and

WHEREAS, OKI staff has incorporated the most current data and processes to deliver an effective program: Now, therefore,

BE IT RESOLVED, that the Board of Directors of the Ohio-Kentucky-Indiana Regional Council of Governments, at its regular public meeting of January 11, 2018, hereby adopts the update to the OKI Participation Plan as recommended by OKI staff.


T.C. ROGERS, PRESIDENT

FP
01/11/18
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The Federal Highway Administration (FHWA), the Federal Transit Administration (FTA), the Ohio Department of Transportation (ODOT), the Kentucky Transportation Cabinet (KYTC), and the units of local and county governments in the OKI region financed the preparation of this document cooperatively.

The opinions, findings and conclusions expressed in this document are those of the Ohio-Kentucky-Indiana Regional Council of Governments (OKI) and are not necessarily those of the U.S. Department of Transportation (U.S. DOT). This report does not constitute a standard, specification, or regulation.

OKI
Mark R. Policinski, Executive Director
Robert Koehler, Deputy Executive Director

Communications
Lorrie Platt, Director of Communications and Legislative Affairs
Florence Parker, Senior Planner and Public Involvement Specialist
Brad Mason, New Media Strategist
Ashley Patrick, Communications Specialist

Transportation Improvement Program (TIP)
Andy Reser, TIP Manager

Transportation Planning
Robyn Bancroft, Strategic Initiatives Manager
Brandon Rudd, Senior Planner/Demographer

OKI Environmental Justice Advisory Committee Members
Adam Goetzman, Committee Chair, Green Township
Bernice Cooper, Freestore Foodbank
Erin Donovan, City of Fairfield Planning
Polly Doran, Council on Aging of Southwestern Ohio
Gina Douthat, Transit Authority of Northern Kentucky (TANK)
Andrew J. Fluegemann, ODOT – District 8
James A. Foster, City of Trenton Economic Development
Allan C. Harris, National Technical Association – Cincinnati Chapter
Joyce Kinley, Kinley and Associates
Alex Koppelman, Planning & Development Services of Kenton County
Kat Lyons, Center for Independent Living Options
Cindy M. Minter, Campbell County Planning & Zoning
Charles Tassell, City of Deer Park
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## INTRODUCTION: CONTEXT FOR POLICY DEVELOPMENT

### ELEMENT 1: PARTICIPATION POLICY AND PROCESS

**Introduction**

- OKI’s Organizational Structure
- Range of Participation Efforts
- Administrative Modification
- Participation Policy
- Participation Process
  - General Provisions for Public Meetings
  - General Provisions for Public Hearings
  - Participation Process for Regional Transportation Plan Update
  - Participation Process for TIP Update
  - Participation Process for Amendments to the TIP and Regional Transportation Plan
  - Corridor and Special Studies
  - Other Provisions for Involving the Public
- Amending the Participation Plan

## ELEMENT 2: PROCESS FOR DEFINING TARGET GROUPS AND AREAS

**Introduction**

- Environmental Justice Population Groups and Areas
- Target Definition Policy
- Target Groups and Areas

## ELEMENT 3: ASSESSING PARTICIPATION EQUITY

**Introduction**

- Participation Assessment

## ELEMENT 4: PLAN IMPLEMENTATION

**Administration of Participation Plan**

- Environmental Justice Advisory Committee
- Technical Support for Plan Implementation
- Evaluation of Participation Plan
# TABLES AND FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table/Figure</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1-1 Transportation Conformity Exempt Project Types</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-1 Year 2011-2015 EJ Groups for the OKI Region</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-2 Year 2011-2015 EJ Target Groups/Areas for the OKI Region</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figures**

1-1 Public Participation and Conformity Decision Tree for Changes to Plan and TIP

A-1 Standard Hierarchy of Census Geographic Entities

A-2: EJ Minority Target Areas 2011-2015

A-3: EJ Low Income Target Areas 2011-2015

A-4: EJ Elderly Target Areas 2011-2015


A-6: EJ Zero Car Household Target Areas 2010

A-7: Combined EJ Target Areas 2011-2015
The Ohio-Kentucky-Indiana Regional Council of Governments (OKI) is the regional planning and intergovernmental coordination agency for the Greater Cincinnati metropolitan area. OKI’s planning area includes nearly 200 units of local governments in a Tri-state area comprised of Butler, Clermont, Hamilton, and Warren counties in Ohio; Boone, Campbell, and Kenton counties in Kentucky; and Dearborn County in Indiana. As the designated Metropolitan Planning Organization (MPO) for the Ohio, Kentucky and Indiana counties in its region, OKI is responsible for the development of a long-range plan and a short-range programming document for transportation, as well as other planning initiatives. Civic engagement concerns apply to the broad spectrum of transportation investments and impacts considered in metropolitan planning, as well as individual projects recommended by OKI. Notices of public participation activities and time established for public review of and comments on the TIP shall also satisfy the Program of Projects (POP) requirements for the Butler County Regional Transit Authority, Clermont Transportation Connection, City of Middletown Transit System, Southwest Ohio Regional Transit Authority, Transit Authority of Northern Kentucky and Warren County Transit System for all projects funded through the Federal Transit Administration.

In developing this Participation Plan, OKI is replacing its former OKI Policy for Environmental Justice (EJ) (April 7, 2003) and OKI Policy for Public Involvement (November 12, 1998). This new plan addresses OKI’s efforts to not only involve the public in transportation decision-making and the provisions for assessing the equity of transportation investments, but also provides a plan for inter-agency coordination and consultation with local governments. The plan is focused on OKI’s transportation program, but it may also be applied to other programs at OKI or used by other agencies. The OKI Board of Directors adopted this Participation Plan on June 14, 2007 with Resolution OKI 2007-21.

As a public agency that receives federal funds and makes recommendations on federal expenditures, OKI is bound by participation requirements for ensuring that federal funds are used fairly and without discrimination. And, per Title 49 U.S.C. Chapter 53, ensures that the requirements of its transportation planning processes are met for flexible funded projects, including project selection requirements.

The basis for EJ is Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, which states:

No person in the United States shall, on the grounds of race, color, or national origin, be excluded from participation in, be denied the benefits of, or be subjected to discrimination under any program or activity receiving Federal financial assistance.
Participation, civic engagement has become a prominent issue for public agencies as the result of a series of federal orders that serve to amplify Title VI. These include:

- FAST Act (Fixing America’s Surface Transportation) effective December 4, 2015
- Moving Ahead for Progress in the 21st Century Act (MAP-21) effective October 2012
- SAFETEA-LU Act (Safe, Accountable, Flexible, Efficient Transportation Equity Act: A Legacy for Users)
- Federal Highway Administration Order in 1998
- U.S. Department of Transportation Order in 1997
- President Clinton issued Executive Order 12898 in 1994, which directed every federal agency to make EJ part of its mission by identifying and addressing the effects of all programs, policies and activities on minority and low income populations.
- The U.S. Department of Transportation issued Departmental Order 5610.2(a) (Actions to Address Environmental Justice in Minority Populations and Low-Income Populations). This Order updates the Department's original Environmental Justice Order 12898. The Order continues to be a key component of the Department's strategy to promote the principles of EJ in all departmental programs, policies, and activities.
- Section 504 of the Rehabilitation Act of 1973
- For agencies like OKI, the Orders issued by federal departments clarified the need to involve the potentially affected public in transportation decision-making processes and assess the equity of transportation investments. The targets of the Participation Plan are the entire public, but provide for additional consideration of EJ populations of minority and low income populations. OKI has chosen to expand its efforts to also address elderly persons, people with disabilities, and zero-car households.
- President George W. Bush issued Executive Order 13166 “Improving Access to Services for Persons with Limited English Proficiency”, 2000 which requires Federal agencies to examine the services they provide, identify any need for services to those with limited English proficiency (LEP), and develop and implement a system to provide those services so LEP persons can have meaningful access to them.
This Plan contains the following four distinct but related elements:

**Element 1:** Presents a policy and process for involvement including focused special efforts to involve EJ target populations

**Element 2:** Describes a process for defining the population groups and areas in the OKI region to be targeted for EJ processes

**Element 3:** Describes a process for assessing the equity of transportation investments on EJ target populations

**Element 4:** Lists the initiatives that OKI will undertake to support the implementation of this plan.
ELEMENT 1
PARTICIPATION POLICY AND PROCESS

INTRODUCTION

OKI seeks public participation as a means of developing effective solutions that can be implemented to address regional issues and needs. To develop solutions that account for the region’s diversity, OKI seeks participation from a broad expanse of its geographic region and the many sectors of its population. To address EJ, OKI makes special efforts to involve Minority and Low Income population groups per Executive Order 12898 but also chooses to track three additional population groups which include the Elderly, People with Disabilities, and Zero-Car Households. Many of these special efforts are focused on areas where EJ populations are most prevalent (terms are defined in Element 2 of the Participation Plan).

In response to federal directives, this plan accounts for the Clean Air Act Amendments of 1990 and federal requirements referenced in the FAST Act. Together, these federal initiatives have greatly enhanced the role of participation in metropolitan-level planning.

Element 1 of the Participation Plan outlines OKI’s strategy and structure used to engage the public in regional planning and agency decisions which may affect their quality of life. The success of efforts to engage the public to participate depends upon the:

- Methods employed to publicize opportunities for participation;
- Access to information for education or comment;
- Type and format of information provided;
- Timing of participation in terms of frequency and correlation to final decision-making;
- Opportunities for dialogue and comment;
- Consideration given to public comments and discussion; and
- Incorporation of public participation.

OKI’S ORGANIZATIONAL STRUCTURE

Independent of OKI’s Participation Plan, the public is involved in OKI decision-making through provisions in the agency’s organizational structure. This structure is related to OKI’s establishment as a public, non-profit organization under the Ohio Revised Code. Agency structure, responsibilities, and authority are described in the OKI Articles of Agreement.

The structure of OKI includes four standing committees that involve public officials and others in the development of plans, programs and policy adoption. These committees are the Board of Directors, the Executive Committee, the Intermodal Coordinating Committee (ICC) and the Environmental Justice (EJ) Advisory Committee. In 2000, the OKI Board established the EJ
Advisory Committee to ensure participation from and to address the needs of EJ population groups. Additional opportunities for direct participation are provided by interim groups – such as task forces, stakeholder groups, or subcommittees, which are established for specific purposes of short duration.

As legally required, OKI’s policy-level committees are dominated by public officials that represent local governments and major transportation and planning agencies. Other public organizations, as well as individual citizens, also serve on these committees. The times and agendas of committee meetings are made available in advance by notification placed on OKI’s website. All meetings are open to the public. Board and committee composition and major functions are summarized below.

- **The Board of Directors** governs OKI and is responsible for regional policy decision-making. Two-thirds of the members are elected officials; the other third includes representatives of local planning agencies, community groups, the private sector and individual citizens. The Board meets quarterly. The Executive Committee is drawn from its membership.

- **The Executive Committee** serves the Board by developing consensus on area-wide or multi-jurisdictional transportation policy matters. The Executive Committee can establish policy, adopt plans, and resolve issues. It can also establish additional committees for advisory purposes. Executive Committee members include an elected official from each member county’s governing body; a cross-section of local governments; and representatives from state transportation agencies, regional planning commissions, and transit agencies. The Executive Committee meets monthly.

- **The Intermodal Coordinating Committee (ICC)** is the technical advisory committee that advises the Board of Directors and Executive Committee on technical issues related to transportation planning. The ICC provides technical review and input to staff and the Executive Committee. Members include local traffic engineers and representatives of transit agencies, utilities, community and environmental groups, and state agencies. The ICC meets monthly, two days prior to meetings of the Executive Committee/Board of Directors.

- **The Environmental Justice Advisory Committee (EJ)** was established to oversee the implementation of the agency’s EJ component of the Participation Plan. The committee’s on-going work includes the review of funding applications and regional EJ efforts.

Other interim groups provide additional planning support for specific issues or projects. Members may include policy-makers, planning professionals, stakeholders, or individual citizens to provide policy and/or technical input to OKI decision-making processes. A group’s membership, mission and duration are determined by the need it is addressing. Interim groups have provided planning support in areas such as corridor studies, long-range plan development and bicycle planning.
RANGE OF PARTICIPATION EFFORTS

The OKI Transportation planning program includes a wide range of outreach participation efforts each with varying degrees of intensity based on the nature of planning effort, project type and federal requirements. This document outlines the approach, timing and level of intensity of the OKI participation efforts for the agency’s primary planning activities.

Meaningful opportunities for participation in OKI’s transportation decision-making are provided through the scheduled updates of the long-range planning and short-range programming elements of the transportation planning process and the development of corridor or special studies. The term “update” as used herein refers to a major revision where the major planning assumptions are revised to reflect new base year population, employment, travel, estimates, or other data. An “amendment” refers to adjustments made to a plan or program in the intermediate years between updates. One other mechanism permissible under federal planning guidelines available to MPO’s is a “modification”. Used almost exclusively for Transportation Improvement Plans (TIP) a modification allows for minor changes in project funding, timing or scope when a new air quality conformity determination is not required. A modification does not require public review or a solicitation for public comment. Figure 1-1: Public Participation and Conformity Decision Tree for Changes to Plan and TIP, which is illustrated below, is used to assist in determining the level of public involvement the agency will undertake for a given change to the TIP.

Notices of public participation activities and time established for public review of and comments on the TIP shall satisfy the Program of Projects (POP) requirements for the Butler County Regional Transit Authority, Clermont Transportation Connection, City of Middletown Transit System, Southwest Ohio Regional Transit Authority, Transit Authority of Northern Kentucky and Warren County Transit System for all projects funded through the Federal Transit Administration.

AMENDMENT

Amendment applies to a revision made to the Plan and the TIP. The type of change that can trigger an amendment includes major changes to:

- project cost,
- project phase initiation dates,
- design scope (e.g., changing project termini or the number of through traffic lanes), the
- addition or deletion of a project, or
- a major change that triggers the need for a new regional emissions analysis for transportation conformity per 40 CFR Part 93

An amendment is a revision that does require:

- public review and comment,
- re-demonstration of fiscal constraint, and a
• new transportation conformity determination (in air quality non-attainment and maintenance areas).

Definition and Function of the Interagency Consultation Group (IAC)

OKI initiates review and discussion by local, state and federal agencies. IAC will review the proposed changes to the Plan and TIP and begin an air quality conformity review, if needed. In cases where an air quality conformity determination is needed, the interagency agency process must be undertaken in accordance with OKI’s Transportation Conformity Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) as adopted by the OKI Board of Directors. The Conformity MOU sets forth policy, criteria, and procedures for demonstrating and assuring conformity of such activities applicable to implementation plans developed according to Part A, Section 110 and Part D of the Clean Air Act.

We all should know that diversity makes for a rich tapestry, and we must understand that all the threads of the tapestry are equal in value no matter what their color.

Maya Angelou
Figure 1-1 Public Participation and Conformity Decision Tree for Changes to Plan and TIP

Determine scope of revision to Plan/TIP

Does revision include a major change in project cost, phase initiation dates, scope, or addition/deletion of a project?

Yes

Revision is an amendment and OKI initiates Interagency Consultation. Does amendment involve changes to timing and scope of a non-exempt project? (Project type not listed in Table 1-1 of Participation Plan)

Yes

Conformity is not required. Public participation will include posting on OKI’s website and opportunity to provide comment for at least 14 days prior to approval by OKI resolution.

No

Is the non-exempt project regionally significant as defined by the transportation conformity regulations?

Yes

New conformity determination is required, but may rely on a previous emissions analysis and a short conformity report. Public participation through posting on OKI’s website and other opportunities to provide comment for at least 14 days prior to approval by OKI resolution.

No

Project is a non-exempt, regionally significant project listed in the adopted Regional Transportation Plan, with no major changes to timing or scope? (i.e., Addition to TIP with same timing and scope in Plan.)

Yes

Project must be incorporated into Plan through either a Plan update or Plan amendment. Participation is thus provided through either a series of public involvement opportunities, posting on OKI website and a public hearing related to the Plan update or, if the TIP amendment occurs in the interval between Plan updates, through a posting on OKI website for at least 14 days and a public hearing to amend the Plan. A new conformity determination and a new regional emission analysis, with a full conformity report, will be completed.

No

Is the non-exempt, regionally significant project listed in the adopted Regional Transportation Plan, with no major changes to timing or scope? (i.e., Addition to TIP with same timing and scope in Plan.)

Yes

New conformity determination is required, but may rely on a previous emissions analysis and a short conformity report. Public participation through posting on OKI’s website and opportunity to provide comment at least 14 days prior to approval by OKI resolution.

No

Project is an Administrative Modification. Conformity is not required. OKI notifies the Inter-agency group and Modification is posted on OKI’s website with review and approval by ICC. (Administrative Modification not required for projects that qualify to utilize the approval TIP Grouped Project List)
ADMINISTRATIVE MODIFICATION

Participation Process for Administrative Modifications to the TIP

Minor changes to a transportation project may be accomplished through an Administrative Modification rather than an Amendment if certain conditions are met. These conditions were approved by the OKI Board of Directors in January, 2014 and are based on the following guidance provided by ODOT:

1. Revise a project description without significant change to the project scope or conflict with the environmental document;
2. Revise a project’s fiscal year within the current TIP;
3. Change the source of funds (from federal to state funds, state to federal funds, federal to local funds, local to federal funds, state to local funds or local to state funds);
4. Split or combine individually listed projects in the current TIP without causing significant change to the project scope, or environmental document;
5. Change funding types for individual statewide line items;
6. Change in the project lead agency;
7. Revise the ALI code, project name, number of vehicles, or type of vehicles;
8. Revise the project phase funding amount listed in the TIP within the following limits for highway projects:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Current Project Phase Cost</th>
<th>Change in Project Phase Cost</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$1 - $2,999,999</td>
<td>over 50% of the project/phase cost</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$3,000,000 - $9,999,999</td>
<td>over 30% of the project/phase cost</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$10,000,000 and above</td>
<td>over 20% of the project/phase cost</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

9. Revise the project phase funding amount listed in the TIP within the following limits for transit projects:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Current Project Phase Cost</th>
<th>Change in Project Cost</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$1 - $999,999</td>
<td>over 50% of the project/phase cost</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$1,000,000 - $4,999,999</td>
<td>over 30% of the project/phase cost</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$5,000,000 and above</td>
<td>over 20% of the project/phase cost</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

If the change to the project fits within one or more of the definitions listed above, the change may be accomplished through an Administrative Modification. The Administrative Modification is posted on the OKI website, with review and approval by the Intermodal Coordinating Committee.
The **OKI Regional Transportation Plan (Plan)**, which is the long-range programming element of OKI’s transportation planning process, addresses the region’s transportation needs for a minimum of 20 years. The public is provided opportunities for participation throughout the entire Plan update process which occurs every four years.

Transportation projects must be consistent with the adopted Plan to be eligible for federal funding. Projects that add capacity to the transportation system must be listed in the adopted Plan. The Plan’s adoption by OKI’s Board of Directors is the final step in the update process. Plan recommendations focus on improving the function and integration of major roadway, transit, freight, bicycle, pedestrian and intermodal facilities. The recommendations are developed to address current transportation problems, future travel conditions (based on projections of travel demand), and federal requirements for mitigating congestion, meeting financial constraints, and addressing air quality and other environmental, social, and financial issues.

The **Transportation Improvement Program, (TIP)**, which is the short-range programming element of OKI’s transportation planning process, schedules transportation projects for funding and implementation over a four-year period. The opportunity for participation is provided when the TIP is updated, which is every two years. Project amendments can occur routinely in the interim between updates. Notices of public participation activities and time established for public review of and comments on the TIP shall also satisfy the Program of Projects (POP) requirements for the Butler County Regional Transit Authority, Clermont Transportation Connection, City of Middletown Transit System, Southwest Ohio Regional Transit Authority, Transit Authority of Northern Kentucky and Warren County Transit System for all projects funded through the Federal Transit Administration.

The TIP includes a variety of projects, but capacity-expansion projects recommended in the Plan must be included in the TIP in order to be eligible for federal funding. These projects are selected and prioritized in coordination with local governments and the ICC. Prioritization is based on criteria that reflect the regional transportation goals found in the Plan, such as increasing safety, reducing congestion and improving economic vitality.

**Corridor and Special Studies** focus on specific areas within the region or specific transportation issues. They are not conducted on a scheduled basis. The study recommendations are reviewed and adopted by the Board of Directors and incorporated into the Plan. Public participation is defined at the on-set of each study and provided for throughout the study’s development.

Corridor and Special studies are conducted for issues requiring detailed study. For Corridor Studies, the participation process is geared toward developing consensus for a solution among those who are most affected. For Special Studies, participation is most often designed to obtain technical or specialized input (such as in a bike plan or freight study). The participation opportunities provided during these studies tend to generate greater...
numbers of participants and more intense interest than other transportation planning processes, but the participants tend to be drawn from a relatively small geographic area or interest group.

PARTICIPATION POLICY

OKI’s Participation Plan is designed to secure active and representative involvement from all segments of the community in planning and decision-making about regional planning issues, goals, problems, alternatives, and solutions. To accomplish this purpose, OKI commits to the following goals:

- **Enable** an early and active role for the public in the development of transportation plans and programs;

- **Identify** and invite a broad range of potentially affected and interested persons, with special efforts to identify EJ populations;

- **Tailor** techniques to meet the diverse needs of the public and the variety of planning activities;

- **Make** special efforts to secure participation and input from EJ populations, including the use of facilities and outreach methods that facilitate their participation;

- **Consult** the public about participation methods as well as planning issues;

- **Evaluate** participation processes and procedures periodically so that adjustments can be made for maximum effectiveness; and

- **Coordinate** with Ohio, Kentucky and Indiana statewide participation plans.
PARTICIPATION PROCESS

General Provisions for Public Meetings

Public meetings will be convened as forums for interactive discussion on a variety of planning studies in order to receive input from community residents.

To encourage meaningful participation by the public, OKI arrangements for public meetings will provide for the following:

- **Timing** so that public comment can be considered as part of the planning process prior to final decision-making;

- **Promotion** to reach a broad and diverse public;

- **Facility** locations that are accessible to people with physical disabilities and in compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA); accessible to public transit, if available and appropriate to the particular study or project; geographically convenient and accessible to the majority of potentially impacted and interested stakeholders; and

- **Develop** strategies that promote participation and facilitate discussion by providing relevant information for public review and a viable opportunity for public comment and discussion.

The information or proposals for which public comment is sought may be presented in a variety of ways including, but not limited to, display boards, 3D models, handouts and audio visual presentations. OKI will present information in a form and style to be generally understood by the public. Terms commonly used only in the transportation planning field will be avoided or explained. Qualified personnel will be available for discussing the information and for answering questions from the public. The meetings will include some format for requesting and obtaining public input including, but not limited to, a question-and-answer session, survey or comment form. OKI will continue to utilize social media platforms as appropriate.

OKI will strive to accommodate persons with special needs. In addition to ensuring that the facility for public meetings and public hearings is ADA compliant, OKI will provide translation services upon request at no cost to the recipient and will participate in hearing relay services for individuals with hearing impairments. OKI is required to conduct a public meeting on a biennial basis, at a minimum, for its transportation planning process. The meeting will be held at OKI and may be conducted in conjunction with an ICC Meeting.
Notification Process for Public Meetings

OKI will use a variety of ways to attract the general public, elected officials and representatives of agencies and organizations to attend public meetings. At a minimum, these methods will include:

1. Legal notices placed in general circulating newspapers and major minority newspaper(s) in their native language at least fourteen days in advance of the meetings;
2. Post a notice on OKI’s website at least fourteen days in advance of the meetings;
3. Submit press releases to major newspapers and community papers;
4. Notify OKI committee members;
5. Notify EJ organizations (i.e., agencies and organizations that serve or represent EJ populations) and selected media targeting EJ populations and,
6. Utilize OKI’s various social networks.

The notification will include, at a minimum, 1) information on the public meeting subject, location, and time; 2) locations where documents are available for review (if applicable), and 3) invitation to participate in the public meeting. Particular efforts will be made to promote the participation of EJ populations.

Process for Public Comment and Response

Comments from public meetings will be recorded, reviewed, and summarized in a document. A summary of comments will be presented to the OKI Board for its consideration prior to Board action on the item. Changes that are significantly different and/or raise new issues from the initial item presented to the Board for action will be made available for public comment. The OKI Board will determine if additional opportunity for public comment is warranted.

General Provisions for Public Hearings

Public hearings will be convened to provide formal documentation of public comments on the major outcomes of OKI’s planning process prior to its presentation to the Board for adoption. These planning process documents include a draft of the Plan update, a draft of the TIP update, and amendments to the Plan in intervals between updates (these would be needed for TIP amendments in which capacity expansion projects are added or deleted).

Public hearings will include a brief overview of the draft Plan, amendments, or TIP before the floor is open for comments. At the hearing, citizens will be able to comment verbally or submit written comments. Public hearings will be held at the OKI office or other suitable locations, which are accessible by transit and accessible to people with disabilities, as ADA specified. The comment period begins with the publication of the legal notice and remains open until OKI Board action is taken. Comments may be submitted to OKI in writing, by email or personal testimony at the Board Meeting at the discretion of the Board President.
Notification Process for Public Hearings

Public hearings will be publicized by:

1. Legal notices placed in the major newspapers and major minority newspaper(s) in their native language at least fourteen days in advance of the hearings;
2. Post a notice on OKI’s website;
3. Notify OKI committee members;
4. Notify EJ organizations (i.e., agencies and organizations that serve or represent EJ populations) and selected media targeting EJ populations and
5. Utilize OKI’s various social networks.

The notification will include, at a minimum, 1) information on the public meeting subject, location, and time; 2) locations where documents are available for review (if applicable), and 3) invitation to participate in the public meeting. Particular efforts will be made to promote the participation of EJ populations.

Availability of Documents for Review and Comment

Documents subject to review and comment at a public hearing will be made available at least fourteen days prior to the public hearings, which coincides with the placement of a legal notice. Copies of draft documents will be placed, at a minimum, on the OKI website and at the OKI office. Copies may be requested from OKI.

Process for Public Comment and Response

Comments on documents subject to public hearings may be made verbally or in writing at the public hearing or transmitted during the comment period.

Comments presented verbally at the public hearings will be recorded and documented. All comments submitted within the comment period will be reviewed and summarized in a document that includes staff responses. Staff responses will be made available to those who provided comment. A summary of comments will be presented to the OKI Board for its consideration prior to Board action on the item.
Participation Process for Regional Transportation Plan Update

Due to the regional, macro-level, and conceptual planning recommendations generated by the Plan, outreach must be flexible to obtain optimal participation from the region’s broad and diverse populations. For each Plan update, OKI will design a unique participation plan which takes advantage of the most current and effective techniques. To address EJ concerns, each Plan update will include an EJ component. Staff will report to ICC and the OKI Executive Committee/Board at regularly scheduled meetings. Participation is critical to developing consensus so that recommendations will advance to implementation.

Notification Process for Public Meetings

The notification process for public meetings will be in accordance with the General Provisions for Public Meetings described above.

Process for Public Comment and Response

Comments from public meetings will be recorded and summarized in a format that includes staff analysis and responses. A summary of comments and responses will be presented to the OKI Board for its consideration prior to the Plan’s adoption and subsequently included, along with any Board modifications, as an appendix to the Plan. If the Plan is changed significantly from the original format made available for public comment and raises new issues, then OKI will provide additional opportunity for public comment on the revised document.
Public Hearing

A public hearing will be held prior to adoption of the Plan update by the OKI Board in accordance with the General Provisions for Public Hearings discussed previously.

Document Availability

Documents subject to review and comment at the public hearing will be made available at least fourteen days prior to the meeting, which coincides with the placement of the legal notice. Copies of draft documents will be placed, at a minimum, on the OKI website, at the OKI office and in each county’s main public library. Copies may be requested from OKI.

Participation Process for TIP Update

For comments on the TIP, OKI will maintain a separate record of comments for subsequent incorporation into the summary of comments prepared in conjunction with the public hearing on the TIP. If the TIP is changed significantly from the initial document made available for public comment and raises new issues, then OKI will provide additional opportunity for public comment on the revised document.

A public hearing will be held prior to adoption of the TIP update by the OKI Board in accordance with the General Provisions for Public Hearings discussed previously.

Participation Process for Amendments to the TIP and Regional Transportation Plan (Plan)

In the intervals between updates, amendments to the TIP and the Plan will be documented in a resolution presented to OKI’s ICC for consideration and then to the OKI Board for approval.

In accordance with FAST Act, participation plans should incorporate a recommended list of projects for which TIP and/or Plan amendments can be processed without a requirement for public review and a new transportation conformity determination. Table 1-1 lists project types that are exempt from a public review requirement and transportation conformity. Exemption of such projects would not deny the public the right for interested parties that are affected by transportation plans, programs and projects to be involved in the early stages or at key decision points in the planning process, since the exempted projects are of types that are typically not identified through the planning process and/or are known to be non-controversial, negligible impact projects. A project for which public review is not required could be subject to public involvement requirements if OKI, in consultation with either the KYTC, Indiana Department of Transportation (INDOT), ODOT, Federal Transit Administration (FTA) or FHWA, determines that public review is appropriate due to a potential for controversy, negative impacts, or public concern for any other reason.
For amendments involving non-exempt projects (project types not included in Table 1-1), public review and a new transportation conformity determination are required. OKI, in consultation with KYTC, INDOT, ODOT, FTA or FHWA, may determine that the amended projects are not regionally significant and therefore the new conformity determination may rely on a previous regional emissions analysis. In this case, the participation process will consist of a posting of the amendment and conformity report on OKI’s website and the opportunity to provide comment for a period of at least fourteen days prior to OKI Board action.

If a TIP amendment involves a non-exempt, regionally significant project it must be incorporated into the Plan in order to be eligible for federal funding, which involves either a Plan update or amendment. Participation is thus provided through either a series of public meetings and a public hearing related to the Plan update or, if the TIP amendment for a capacity expansion project occurs in the interval between Plan updates, through a public hearing to amend the Plan.

**Corridor and Special Studies**

**Corridor Studies**

Due to the discussion of local issues which often generate intensive public interest, corridor studies are a major focus of OKI’s participation efforts. For each corridor study, OKI will design a unique participation process to obtain optimal participation from the area’s key stakeholders, a diversity of community and special interest groups, and the general public. To address EJ concerns, each corridor plan will include an EJ component for participation. At a minimum, each corridor study will have its own advisory group that oversees the study process and is involved in designing the participation process, study goals, problem definition, alternative solutions, and selection of preferred alternatives. In addition, each study may apply any number of other methods to provide public outreach or obtain public input. Participation is important for developing consensus so that recommendations will advance to implementation. Public Meetings are valuable to the process and will be held at locations appropriate to attract stakeholder input. Public Hearings are not required for corridor studies.

**Special Studies**

For special studies that focus on specific transportation issues (such as a bike plan or a freight study), OKI will tailor an individual participation program based on project scope, funding, and purpose. Efforts to involve the public may include developing a separate committee for the study duration as well as a combination of efforts to provide outreach and obtain input from affected organizations and the general public. Study recommendations incorporated into the Plan are subject to the participation efforts conducted as part of the Plan amendment process. Public Meetings are valuable to the process and will be held at locations appropriate to attract stakeholder input. Public Hearings are not required for special studies.
Table 1-1: TRANSPORTATION CONFORMITY EXEMPT PROJECT TYPES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Safety</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Railroad/Highway crossing</td>
<td>Skid treatments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shoulder improvements</td>
<td>Adding medians</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increasing sight distance</td>
<td>Truck climbing lanes outside the urbanized areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traffic control devices and operating assistance</td>
<td>Lighting improvements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Railroad/highway crossing warning devices</td>
<td>Widening narrow pavements or reconstructing, rehabilitation, or replacement of bridges (no additional travel lanes)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guardrails, median barriers, crash cushions</td>
<td>Emergency truck pullovers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pavement resurfacing, restoration and/or rehabilitation</td>
<td>Safety roadside rest areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pavement marking</td>
<td>Changes in vertical and horizontal alignment *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emergency relief</td>
<td>Truck size and weight inspection stations *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fencing</td>
<td>Interchange reconfiguration projects *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changes in access control for safety</td>
<td>Intersection signalization at individual intersections *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hazard elimination program, highway safety improvement program</td>
<td>Intersection channelization *</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Transit</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Operating assistance to transit agencies</td>
<td>Construction of small transit passenger shelters and information kiosks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchase of transit support vehicles</td>
<td>Reconstruction or renovation of transit buildings and structures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rehabilitation of transit vehicles</td>
<td>Purchase of new buses or rail cars to replace existing vehicles or for minor expansions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchase of office, shop, and operating equipment for existing transit facilities</td>
<td>Transportation corridor fringe parking facilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchase of operating equipment for transit vehicles (e.g. radios, fare boxes, lifts, etc.)</td>
<td>Bus terminal and transfer points *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction or renovation of power, signal, and communications systems for transit</td>
<td>Construction of new bus or rail storage/maintenance facilities *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alterations to facilities or vehicles in order to make them accessible for elderly and handicapped persons</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Air Quality</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Continuation of ride-sharing and van-pooling promotion activities at current levels</td>
<td>Bicycle and pedestrian facilities</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Other Minor Projects</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Planning and technical studies</td>
<td>Acquisition of scenic easements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engineering to assess social, economic, and environmental effects of the proposed action</td>
<td>Planting and landscaping</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Noise attenuation</td>
<td>Directional and information signs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emergency or hardship advance land acquisitions</td>
<td>Repair of damage caused by natural disasters, civil unrest, or terrorist acts</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Projects must meet criteria for categorical exclusion*
Other Provisions for Involving the Public

**OKI Website**

To increase public awareness and understanding of OKI planning efforts and opportunities for participation, OKI will maintain a website (www.oki.org) with information on the agency, its planning activities, and special opportunities for participation. Information will be updated on a regular basis.

**Networking**

Networking involves OKI staff presenting information and seeking opportunities for discussion to groups with a special interest in transportation planning. OKI will offer networking opportunities during the update of the Plan and in the intervals between Plan updates. A networking session may feature an explanation of the planning process, plan recommendations, or a planning issue and will include a question-and-answer session. OKI may distribute handouts, a survey form, or use other methods to provide information or obtain input. OKI will be available for networking in response to requests and will continue to promote its availability to EJ communities and organizations.

Additionally, OKI’s analysis of roadways within the urbanized area is a critical element which will be provided to each individual State Highway Safety Plan (SHSP). The use of safety conscious planning workshops is a component of this process and furthers the interagency consultation efforts to implement projects and programs. Through such participation efforts, OKI ensures outreach to and input from local and regional safety stakeholders including, but not limited to, transit providers, elected officials and staff from departments of environmental services, police, fire, emergency services and planning.

**Other Outreach Methods**

Independent of efforts to involve the public as described in preceding sections, OKI may make additional outreach efforts at any time. The outreach method and timing will be determined based on the need for education, the nature of the planning effort, and the audience to be reached. Methods for increasing public awareness of transportation issues or participation opportunities include, but are not limited to, social media, press releases, public service announcements, media briefings, newspaper articles, and coordination with EJ communities or organizations. Methods to provide for public education include, but are not limited to, social media, newsletters, information displays, fact sheets, brochures, a speaker’s bureau, and information for distribution by EJ communities or organizations.
Additional Participation of EJ Populations

In addition to the efforts to involve EJ populations in OKI transportation planning as provided in the preceding sections, and in addition to the resources to improve communication with EJ populations as discussed in Participation Plan Element 4, there may be occasions in which public comment is needed from one or more EJ populations or, perhaps for a corridor study, at a level more localized than which OKI is traditionally involved. In that case, OKI will seek to collaborate with the public and private organizations that represent or serve these special populations. This collaboration would involve working with agencies/organizations willing to present information to the people they serve or represent; provide space in their newsletters; allow meetings in their facilities, or otherwise serve as intermediaries. These agencies/organizations may include, but are not necessarily limited to, congregations, schools, neighborhood centers, housing associations, adult education centers, and sponsors of special events.

Availability of Data

In addition to drafts of the Plan and the TIP being available for review and comment, these and other documents and technical information will be available to the public in response to requests. Reproduction costs of more than 10 pages will be borne by the party making the request.

Statement of Non-Discrimination

In carrying out this policy to involve the public in transportation plans and programs, discrimination against any person because of political or religious opinion or affiliation or because of race, creed, color, national origin, sex, age, income or disability is hereby prohibited.

Amending the Participation Plan

In accordance with FAST Act legislation, this OKI Participation Plan is developed “in consultation with all interested parties.” This consultation requirement is intended to afford all parties who participate in the regional planning process a specific opportunity to comment on the Plan prior to its approval or subsequent amendment. The update process for this document – the OKI Participation Plan – is required four years after the document’s adoption and every four years thereafter. Revisions to this document will be preceded by a 45-day public review period. OKI is committed to consideration of public input.
INTRODUCTION

“Target Groups” are concentrations within the OKI region of the population groups addressed by EJ. These concentrations are located within “Target Areas.” The process for defining Target Groups goes hand-in-hand with the definition of Target Areas, and the terms Target Group and Target Area are often interchangeable.

OKI has defined Target Groups and Areas for five population groups: Minority, Low Income, and Elderly populations; People with Disabilities; and Zero-Car Households. These Target Groups and Areas are subject to special efforts in OKI’s Participation Plan, as described in Plan Elements 1 and 4. The Minority and Low Income Target Groups and Areas are also the focus of an assessment of the equity of transportation recommendations, as explained in Plan Element 3.

The focus of Plan Element 2 is OKI’s process for defining Target Groups and Areas. The process uses census data to identify where EJ population groups are most concentrated. The data and maps developed at the time of this plan’s publication are based on the most current available census data. The Target Groups and Areas will be reviewed no less than every four years, in conjunction with the update of the Plan, and the definition process may be revised at any time.

As a two-step process, the definition of Target Groups and Areas involves first identifying the general distribution of each EJ population group and then defining where each group is most concentrated. Where the concentration of an EJ population group meets or exceeds the regional average and has an EJ population of more than 250, the EJ population is considered to be part of a Target Group and Area. The definition process is based on small-area data that results in the identification of multiple, non-contiguous areas with EJ population concentrations. For each EJ population group, these dispersed concentrations are referred to collectively as a Target Group and the multiple locations of the concentrations are referred to collectively as a Target Area. The definition of Target Groups and Areas is based on guidance published by ODOT [Guidance for Best Practices for Incorporating Environmental Justice into Ohio Transportation Planning and Environmental Processes, August, 2002].
ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE POPULATION GROUPS AND AREAS

Of the five population groups for which OKI defines Target Groups and Areas, only the Minority and Low Income populations are listed in the Executive Order 12898 on Environmental Justice. The Elderly population and People with Disabilities are included in FAST Act, but they are not required to be addressed under EJ unless they are included in the finalized version of the Federal Rules. Zero-Car Households are a logical and reasonable extension of EJ, but this group is not included in the Executive Order or the Proposed Rules. OKI chooses to track all five EJ population groups.

The composition of the five EJ population groups is defined in federal documents related to EJ and in U.S. decennial censuses and the American Community Survey (ACS).

**Minority** is comprised of four groups as defined in final U.S. DOT Order on Environmental Justice (Federal Register April 15, 1997) which includes persons from every racial category except White Alone plus all Hispanic persons:

1. Black (a person having origins in any of the black racial groups of Africa);
2. Hispanic (a person of Mexican, Puerto Rican, Cuban, Central or South American, or other Spanish culture or origin, regardless of race);
3. Asian American (a person having origins in any of the original peoples of the Far East, Southeast Asia, the Indian subcontinent, or the Pacific Islands); or
4. American Indian and Alaskan Native (a person having origins in any of the original people of North America and who maintains cultural identification through tribal affiliation or community recognition).

**Low Income**, as defined in final U.S. DOT Order on Environmental Justice (Federal Register April 15, 1997), refers to people in households where the median income is at or below poverty level.

**Elderly**, as per Federal guidelines, comprises those age 65 and older.

**People with Disabilities**, non-institutionalized persons aged 16-64 who have a sensory, physical, mental or self-care disability; going outside the home disability; or employment disability.

**Zero-Car Households**, occupied housing units for which there is no car or access to one.
TARGET DEFINITION POLICY

For each EJ population group, the Target Group and Area is the basis for conducting efforts under this Participation Plan. The Target Group lives where the EJ population group is most concentrated. This concept is also explained in ODOT’s [Guidance for Best Practices for Incorporating Environmental Justice into Ohio Transportation Planning and Environmental Processes, August, 2002):

Typically low income and minority populations are spread throughout the regional area and state but are likely to be located in concentrated locations or neighborhoods. These areas should have a significantly higher percentage of low income and minority population than the regional or statewide average. These areas can then be identified as target areas.

Target Groups and Areas are defined based on U.S. Census data. Census data is available at different levels including place, township, census tract, block group and block. Block Groups are subdivisions of a Census Tract and are the smallest geographic units for which the Census Bureau tabulates sample data needed in EJ analysis. Since Block Groups are more refined than Census Tracts, OKI will use U.S. Census data allocated to Census Block Groups for the purpose of identifying Target Groups/Areas. The Target Areas based on Block Groups will be used for individual project evaluation. For assessing participation equity (see Plan Element 3), OKI will use Traffic Analysis Zone geography. Traffic Analysis Zones are the geographic units used for modeling the performance and assessing the needs of the region’s transportation system.

OKI’s definition process corresponds to ODOT’s guidance for identifying target populations for Low Income and Minority populations. OKI has further expanded its process to include the Elderly population, People with Disabilities, and Zero-Car households by:

- Identifying the number and the percentage of low income and minority populations in the entire OKI region, project impact region or the state;
- Calculating the average percentage of low income and minority populations of the entire region, project area or state;
- Using that percentage as a reference point to identify locations with target EJ populations of low income and minority populations.

As clarified in ODOT’s [Guidance for Best Practices for Incorporating Environmental Justice into Ohio Transportation Planning and Environmental Processes, August, 2002], the average percentage is a reference point for calculating a threshold percentage for defining a Target Group and Area. In addition, OKI will apply a numeric threshold of 250 for defining a Target Group and Area. The EJ populations in census block groups where the EJ population both exceeds the regional average and there are more than 250 EJ persons (or households in the case of zero cars) will be defined as the Target Group. For example, for the Minority population, the 2011-2015 regional average is 20.18 percent which then becomes the threshold percentage. The census block groups where the Minority population is 20.18 percent or more of the block group’s total population and the number of Minority persons exceeds 250 are part...
of the Target Area that contains the Target Group population. It should be noted that the Census Bureau combines five years’ worth of data to create a larger sample size and a more accurate estimate because of the small size of Block Groups. The data represent an average condition over the course of the sample years, which in this case are 2011 through 2015.

TARGET GROUPS AND AREAS

The EJ Advisory Committee decided that any block group containing the regional average (regional threshold) or more of a target population (target group) and whose target population exceeded 250 would be considered a target area. Tables and maps displaying details about the current Target Groups/Areas can be found in the Appendix of this document. Target Groups/Areas can be updated annually if necessary as new data becomes available from the American Community Survey. Data updates will be provided in the appendices of Plan documents.

The data has been aggregated according to the specifications and in accordance with [Guidance and Best Practices for Incorporating Environmental Justice into Ohio Transportation Planning and Environmental Processes, August, 2002]. Data have been gathered for low income, minority, elderly, people with disabilities and zero-car household groups in the OKI planning region.

As the data were analyzed, OKI staff noted that a few Block Groups had unusually high margins of error, especially for the Minority and Low-Income EJ variables. As a result, staff created additional steps in our methodology for identifying EJ Block Groups for the Minority and Low-Income variables. Once it was confirmed that a Block Group met the numeric and percentage thresholds, staff evaluated the quality of the data based on the margin of error and the corresponding data at the Census Tract level. A Block Group was eliminated from being classified as an EJ Target Area if it met the following two conditions:

1. It had a margin of error for the target population in the Block Group (for the Minority variable staff used largest minority group present) that exceeded the estimate for that target population, and;

2. The target group population in the Block Group exceeded the estimate for that target group population in the Census Tract in which the Block Group was contained.

These additional levels of analysis identified and eliminated two Block Groups from OKI’s Target Area for the Minority EJ variable that staff is highly confident were misidentified by the Census data. No Low-Income Block Groups were affected.
ASSESSING PARTICIPATION EQUITY

INTRODUCTION

To address the needs for EJ populations, regional planning investments must provide an equitable distribution of benefits and should not result in a disproportionate burden of adverse impacts on Minority and Low Income population groups. To monitor public participation endeavors and ensure that the goals established by this Participation Plan are met, OKI has developed an assessment process.

PARTICIPATION ASSESSMENT

The assessment process compares the impacts of the Plan and TIP recommendations on Minority and Low Income target areas with the entire region (target areas are defined in Element 2). The impacts are calculated by OKI’s Regional Travel Demand Model for transportation mobility and accessibility.

In transportation planning, the Travel Demand Model is used to forecast travel patterns for different transportation scenarios and then calculate data for measuring the impacts of the different travel patterns, such as total vehicle-miles-of-travel and pollutant emissions. These impact measures are analyzed as a basis for recommending a plan or TIP.

In the Participation Plan assessment process, OKI uses the Travel Demand Model to estimate such things as traffic volumes, transit ridership and travel times as a basis for assessing the impact of transportation investments on EJ target and non-target areas. For assessing the Plan that includes a TIP, these EJ impact measures will be calculated for the following transportation scenarios:

1. The existing transportation system (base year)
2. The “existing plus committed” system (the existing system under future conditions modified only by project recommendations in the TIP)
3. The future transportation system as recommended in the Plan
OKI will use a variety of impact measures that relate to transportation mobility and accessibility. Some will be able to be estimated using the OKI Travel Model and others will require different approaches. Measures will be used from six general categories which are described on the following page. Each of these categories will be reported by mode (auto vs. bus) and/or travel time, where appropriate. The following measures have been identified as objectives to be evaluated:

Mobility/Congestion
- Travel Time
- Percentage of vehicle miles traveled in congestion

Accessibility
- Job opportunities within 20 minutes auto travel time
- Job opportunities within 20 minutes transit travel time
- Job opportunities within 40 minutes transit travel time
- Percentage of population within 40 minutes transit travel time of a college/university

Reliability
- Dependable transit service as measured by percent of on-time arrivals

Safety
- Transit safety as measured by the number of crashes

Equity
- Supply of transportation infrastructure and services
- Displacement of residents and business
- Social Structure
- Expenditures on highway projects
- Expenditures on transit projects

Other Regional Performance Measures
- Environmental Impacts
- Financial impacts
- System performance indicators

From the data developed in the assessment process, the transportation conditions for Minority and Low Income target areas will be compared with those of non-target areas. For three other population groups (i.e., Elderly population, People with Disabilities, and Zero-Car Households), OKI will define target areas and develop data, but is not required to conduct an EJ assessment. The significance of the comparative process for these groups is reduced by the relatively dispersed distribution of the Elderly population and People with Disabilities, for which the target areas contain less than half the group population, and by the strong correlation of the Zero-Car Household target area to the Minority and Low Income target areas.
ELEMENT 4

PLAN IMPLEMENTATION

ADMINISTRATION OF PARTICIPATION PLAN

OKI is committed to this document’s implementation. This level of commitment is exemplified in several ways:

- Ensuring the proper conduct of the provisions in OKI’s Participation Plan
- Coordinating with EJ organizations and communities
- Monitoring OKI’s coordination with Title VI, ADA, LEP and Section 504
- Researching approaches used by other MPOs to address Participation
- Serving as OKI’s advocate for participation of EJ groups/areas
- Assessing the need for modifications to OKI’s Participation Plan
- Providing staff support to an OKI EJ Advisory Committee
- Consulting with local and state resource agencies to develop the best strategies for mitigating environmental impacts on a regional level
- Assessing the effectiveness and equity of the Participation Plan’s provisions for public participation.

Participation Plan Administrator

OKI has established a position for overseeing the implementation of the agency’s Participation Plan. This position involves responsibility for the bullets listed above. This position is currently filled by:

Florence J. Parker
OKI Regional Council of Governments
720 East Pete Rose Way, Suite 420
Cincinnati, OH 45202
T: 513-619-7686  F: 513-621-9325
fparker@oki.org

ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE ADVISORY COMMITTEE

OKI has an EJ Advisory Committee to:

- Provide oversight of the application of OKI’s Participation Plan
- Monitor the overall effectiveness of OKI’s Participation Plan and compliance with federal policy
- Ensure input on EJ regional planning needs and concerns in OKI’s decision-making process
- Participate in the TIP and Plan project prioritization process
TECHNICAL SUPPORT FOR PLAN IMPLEMENTATION

- OKI will develop and maintain an **EJ Network List** that will identify key agencies/organizations that serve Minority, Low Income, and Elderly populations, People with Disabilities or serve as their advocates, and Zero-Car Households. This list will include major churches and ministerial organizations. The list will provide indications of how agencies/organizations may be used for implementing OKI’s Participation Plan, including, but not limited to, their interest in providing coordination to OKI, acting as liaison with the community/clients/congregations, and/or disseminating information by newsletter or other means. The list will include names of contacts, phone numbers, and email addresses. OKI will also utilize various social media platforms to enhance information distribution and reach.

- A **List of Recommended Facilities** will be developed. The list will indicate facilities preferred as sites for meetings with or making information available to EJ Target Groups/Areas. Information will be provided on transit access, access for people with disabilities, size of meeting space, etc., as well as street address, community, name of contact person, and phone number. The list may include libraries, faith-based communities/congregations, schools, medical buildings, agencies, EJ organization facilities, and businesses serving EJ populations.

- A **Media List** of sources available for reaching EJ population groups will be developed. The list will include public newspapers, agency/organization newsletters (for communities, public agencies, private organizations, faith communities/congregations, schools), radio stations (including Radio Reading Service), and special events.

- OKI will develop a database on **EJ Target Areas** designed for public access. It will include, but not necessarily be limited to, base data and summary analysis of the Target Groups/Areas (see plan Element 2) and lists and/or maps of jurisdictions, communities, or neighborhoods in EJ Target Areas.

- As dictated by federal mandates and discrete scopes of work, OKI coordinates and consults with a number of public, private and non-profit agencies and organizations on regional or sub-regional transportation studies, plans and programs, including the 2040 OKI Regional Transportation Plan, the TIP, the Strategic Regional Policy Plan, and several corridor studies. This includes agencies that are responsible for land use management, natural resources, environmental protection, conservation and historic preservation.

- Through consultation with resource agencies, OKI works to develop the best strategies for mitigating environmental impacts on a regional level. To the extent possible, key environmental resource agency personnel are included on OKI committees.
Environmental resource agencies are also invited to review and comment on the Plan and other major documents. Coordination and consultation occur as necessary in formal and informal settings, on long- and short-term basis, and in individual contacts and group discussions.

The following are some of the agencies and organizations with which OKI has interacted in the past and will consult with in the future to enhance participation efforts:

- Federal and state transportation departments
- Federal and state environmental agencies
- Federal and state natural resources agencies
- U.S. Army Corps of Engineers
- U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service
- U.S. Department of Agriculture
- U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
- Federal Aviation Administration
- National Park Service
- Federal and state emergency management agencies
- Federal, state and local homeland security agencies
- State air quality agencies
  - Indiana Department of Environmental Management
  - Kentucky Natural Resource and Environmental Protection Cabinet
  - Ohio Environmental Protection Agency
- State historic preservation offices
- State departments of agriculture
- Public transit service providers
  - Butler County Regional Transit Authority
  - Clermont Transportation Connection
  - City of Middletown Transit System
  - Southwest Ohio Regional Transit Authority
  - Transit Authority for Northern Kentucky
  - Warren County Transit System
- Local elected officials
- Local government planning commissions
- Local government public works and engineering departments
- Local transportation improvement districts
- Local government environmental services departments
- Local government public safety departments
- Regional and local water and sewer districts or departments
- Soil and water conservation districts
- Resource conservation and development districts
- Flood control districts
- Local park districts
- Local recreation departments
- Local health departments
- Local watershed planning groups
- Local government economic development offices
- Local agencies for children, seniors and the disabled
- Local school districts, colleges and universities
- Local hospital associations
- Local business and community/neighborhood associations
- The United Way
- Trade and industry associations, such as chambers of commerce, the Hispanic Chamber of Commerce, Greater Cincinnati & Northern Kentucky African American Chamber of Commerce, Homebuilders associations, Realtors, and Farm Bureau Federation chapters
- Civic associations, such as the NAACP, the Urban League, the Sierra Club, the League of Women Voters, and Citizens for Civic Renewal

**EVALUATION OF PARTICIPATION PLAN**

OKI will conduct a four year review of the effectiveness of its participation process. OKI will develop evaluation forms (as indicated below) for use at public meetings. The forms may also be used for other participation efforts. The distribution, collection, review, and maintenance of the forms will be the responsibility of OKI staff responsible for administering the Participation Plan. The forms will be made available to the public for review on request.

- **A Record of Participation** will be completed by OKI staff. It will include, at a minimum, information on:
  - Meeting date, time, location, and topics
  - Methods for publicizing the meeting
  - Number of participants (excluding staff) by categories such as OKI committee member, elected official, agency staff, organization affiliate, unaffiliated citizens

- **A Comment Sheet for Evaluation by Participants** will be available at each public meeting. Participants will be encouraged to complete the Comment Sheet before leaving the meeting. It will include the meeting date, time, location, and topic. Participants will be asked for information that includes:
  - Participant’s comments on the information presented
  - Participant’s name, mailing address, telephone number, email address, neighborhood for residence and work, and interest in coming to the meeting (such as OKI committee member, elected official, agency staff, organization affiliate, community resident, community business, etc.). The Comment Sheet will note that the participant’s response to this question is optional.
  - How participant learned of the meeting (checkboxes)
Appendix: Environmental Justice Target Groups and Target Areas

Data from the U.S. Census Bureau’s decennial censuses and American Community Surveys (ACS) are the bases for determination of the Environmental Justice (EJ) Target Groups and Target Areas. Decennial census data, as the name implies, is gathered once each decade in years ending in zero from every household in the nation. Decennial census data is limited to a small selection of subject matter but is available for every level of geography, from the smallest (census block) to the largest (nation as a whole).

The American Community Survey, on the other hand, consists of a sample of households, with data being collected continuously. The ACS covers a large number of subject areas and new data sets are released annually. Tabulations based on one year’s accumulation of data are available for geographies with populations of 65,000 or more and three-year data is available for geographies with populations of 20,000 or more. An accumulation of five years of ACS data is required for geographic areas with populations less than 20,000, with the block group being the smallest unit of geography for which ACS data is tabulated. The diagram below illustrates the various geographies for which census data is tabulated.
Data from the 2011-2015 American Community Survey at the block group level have been used to identify the current EJ Target Groups and Areas. Identification of Minority, Low-Income, Elderly, People with Disabilities, and Zero-Car Household populations were accomplished using Tables B03002, B17021, B01001, B23024, and B25044, respectively. The following table shows the number and percent of each EJ Group in the OKI region. The Percent figures for each EJ Group constitute the regional threshold.

### Table A-1. 2011-2015 EJ Groups for the OKI Region

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EJ Group</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Minority</td>
<td>408,882</td>
<td>20.18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low Income</td>
<td>278,126</td>
<td>14.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elderly</td>
<td>266,065</td>
<td>13.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disabled</td>
<td>127,929</td>
<td>10.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zero Car</td>
<td>65,019</td>
<td>8.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Regional Total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Population</td>
<td>2,025,711</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Households</td>
<td>780,574</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Population Ages 20-64</td>
<td>1,196,200</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Block groups were eligible for designation as EJ Target Groups if they met two criteria. First, the block group’s EJ population (households in the case of the Zero-Car EJ group) had to meet or exceed the regional threshold. Secondly, the block group’s EJ population/households had to meet or exceed 250.
Additionally, for the Minority and Low-Income variables the margin of error was evaluated using the criteria that is discussed on page 24 of this document.

The threshold percentages for each EJ population are shown in the table below, along with the regional total of each Target Group, the percentage of the EJ population group located in the Target Areas, and the number of Census Block Groups in the Target Areas. Maps of the 2015 Target Areas are provided on subsequent pages.

Table A-2. 2011-2015 EJ Target Groups/Areas for the OKI Region

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Target Group</th>
<th>Regional Threshold (%)</th>
<th>EJ Population in Target Areas</th>
<th>% of EJ Pop. in Target Areas</th>
<th>No. of Block Groups in Target Areas</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Minority</td>
<td>20.18</td>
<td>291,072</td>
<td>71.19</td>
<td>475</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low Income</td>
<td>14.05</td>
<td>176,143</td>
<td>63.33</td>
<td>377</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elderly</td>
<td>13.13</td>
<td>125,077</td>
<td>47.01</td>
<td>346</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disabled</td>
<td>10.69</td>
<td>10,576</td>
<td>8.27</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zero Car Households</td>
<td>8.33</td>
<td>9,445</td>
<td>14.53</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure A-2. EJ Minority Target Areas 2011-2015

- Block Groups
- EJ Minority Block Groups
Figure A-3. EJ Low Income Target Areas 2011-2015
Figure A-4. EJ Elderly Target Areas 2011-2015

Block Groups
EJ Elderly Block Groups
Figure A-5. EJ Population with Disabilities Target Areas 2011-2015

Block Groups
EJ Disabilities Block Groups
Figure A-6. EJ Zero-Car Household Target Areas 2010

- Block Groups
- EJ Zero Car Block Groups